

**Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary  
Sanctuary Advisory Council**

**FINAL Key Meeting Outcomes  
May 17, 2013  
Casa Las Palmas, Santa Barbara, CA**

*Note: After adoption by council vote (likely on July 19, 2013), this document will be posted on line at <http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/minutes.html>. Audio recordings of this and other Council meetings are available upon request to [michael.murray@noaa.gov](mailto:michael.murray@noaa.gov).*

**Attendance:** At peak, sixteen of the Council's twenty-one voting seats were present (see attached attendance roster). Five seats were absent for the day: California Department of Fish and Wildlife, California Coastal Commission, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Chumash Community, and Ventura County. Public attendance varied from 5 to 10 people.

**Administrative Business and Announcements**

Dianne Black, newly appointed Chair of the Sanctuary Advisory Council, called the meeting to order and introduced reappointed and newly appointed council members: Michael Cohen, business member; Capt. Kip Louttit, business alternate; Stuart Wilson, non-consumptive recreation alternate; Shelby Mendez, NOAA Fisheries alternate; and LT Cody Dunagan, USCG alternate. The new members introduced themselves to the council.

Draft key outcomes from the March 15, 2013 meeting were unanimously approved as final.

***Superintendent's Report***

Superintendent Chris Mobley highlighted several items in the Superintendent's Report (provided to all SAC members and the attending public, available at <http://www.channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/super.html>). Chris highlighted the pending CINMS office move to UCSB at the end of May but confirmed that our partnerships in the harbors are important and that we expect to remain engaged in those communities. Chris reported that construction of the Channel Islands Boating Center in Oxnard at the Channel Islands Harbor is now complete and will be a great venue for students, the public, meetings, and some office space for CINMS staff. Chris also reported that the MERITO Program has received non-profit status and some grants that will help keep that program going under the dedicated direction of Rocio Lozano. Chris mentioned that he did some outreach to the Santa Barbara Conference and Visitors Bureau, with help from council member Michael Cohen, and they were very receptive and interested in marketing the sanctuary as a destination for our area. Chris commented on how CINMS has become a leader in the field of Unmanned Aerial Systems (UAS) technology and application, noting that staff member Ben Waltenberger recently became an authorized UAS pilot and that for years now Todd Jacobs has led the charge in demonstrating field capabilities of UAS all around the country. Chris added that the Scripps Whale Acoustic Lab recently completed a successful project deploying equipment from R/V *Shearwater*. Chris also announced that the Ocean for Life Program is soon making its second return to CINMS in June and July 2013. Chris explained that a budget allocation was finally received for fiscal year 2013, and that the CINMS budget is essentially flat compared to last year. Chris said that the R/V *Shearwater* reached her 10-year mark, and shared some impressive vessel use statistics including 1,288 days at sea and an excellent safety record.

***Council Executive Committee Report***

Chair Dianne Black introduced the Executive Committee's initiative to draft a print media op-ed letter to bring attention to World Oceans Day, June 8th. Several council members provided some wording change suggestions. There was a suggestion from Susan Curtis about sending the item as a press release which may prompt the media to publish it as a drop-in letter or to create an article. Chris responded that Shauna Bingham from CINMS could work with multiple outlets explore various possible formats, checking with Susan Curtis. By a 16-

0 voice vote with no abstentions, the council supported adopting of the letter, as amended, and recommended that staff work with Susan Curtis on strategies for publishing the letter.

### ***Council Member Announcements***

A number of Council members shared announcements (unrelated to meeting agenda items). Audio recordings are available upon request.

### **Research Activities Panel (RAP) Meeting Report, Proposed Communication on Draft National Condition Report, and Questions/Discussion about Channel Islands MPA Reporting**

Dr. Robert (Bob) Warner first summarized the recent RAP meeting held on April 2, 2013 by highlighting how monitoring of resources within the sanctuary has decreased due to an overall lack of funding experienced by most partners. Dr. Warner nonetheless described it as an inspiring RAP meeting because of a helpful information exchange by participants. One concerning report raised at the RAP meeting was the issue of a pathogen that appears to be affecting wild abalone. Bruce Steele commented that transmission of the pathogen is thought to be from aquaculture.

Dr. Warner next reported that the RAP commented on a recently shared draft National Condition Report prepared by NOAA's Office of National Marine Sanctuaries. He explained that it is the RAP's concern that expert opinion should not be a substitute for good data and monitoring. As such, he explained, the RAP feels the national condition report should be really used to guide future research, and not to make management decisions. The RAP drafted a memo expressing these and other related concerns [distributed to all, and available at [http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/report\\_doc.html](http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/report_doc.html)] and this was brought before the council for consideration. In the memo, the RAP emphasized that: "Our greatest concern is that such reports, both in local and nationally summarized forms, will be used as a substitute for reliable, actionable information. Although stated many times in the past, it remains true: Expert opinion cannot be used as a cheap alternative to monitoring." Several members expressed support for the points raised in the RAP's memo, and there was no disagreement voiced regarding the RAP views. However, some council members took issue with other aspects of the draft national condition report. Particular angst expressed by fishing representatives that felt the characterization of fishing as a "primary" threat was neither substantiated nor consistent with messages heard from local sanctuary staff. Bruce Steele also commented that climate change and ocean acidification were not treated in the report as the high priority that they should be. John Ugoretz offered a motion that was subsequently seconded and approved by a voice vote of 16-0, which resulted in the council approving the RAP memo to be transmitted to Chris Mobley and the ONMS headquarters office, and to include a SAC cover letter that indicates that other council members have concerns about the report [to be shared in detail by sanctuary staff], and to offer that the council would be willing to discuss the report further if there is time and interest. Also amended to the motion was council approval for Dr. Warner to share the RAP memo with research seat representatives at other sanctuary advisory councils.

The second issue brought to the council from the RAP involved possible future reporting approaches related to studies and monitoring performed in and around the Channel Islands marine protected areas. Dr. Warner indicated that while there is an interest in reporting on ongoing monitoring, there is no mandate to do so by the California Fish and Game Commission at the 10-year mark (reached in 2013), and no particular funding to do so. Reporting for the RAP, Dr. Warner asked for feedback on two ideas. The first suggestion was a short term step to invite the principal investigators with PISCO and the Channel Islands National Park's Kelp Forest Monitoring Program to report on their cumulative MPA-related monitoring work at a future SAC meeting. Council members expressed general support for this idea. The second idea Dr. Warner described (and shared in a RAP memo) would involve a larger-scale reporting effort to include other monitoring programs, data analyses and synthesis. For this to happen, funding and other support would be needed. Discussion by council members on this idea revealed various perspectives, including the suggestion (John Ugoretz) that such reporting on the Channel Islands MPAs could be rolled into the 5-year report that will take place for southern California MPAs (presumably in 2017), and a countering view/concern that the Channel Islands MPAs are different, should not get lost within 5-year reporting on other MPAs (Greg Helms, Bruce Steele), and perhaps could set the stage for

broader system reporting to include talks about oceanography, chemistry, etc. (Bruce Steele). Although there was not time for the council to reach agreement on these details, in general council members expressed support for some type of future broader reporting on Channel Islands MPAs, and for finding the necessary funding to make that happen.

### **Public comment**

Chris Voss, a former commercial abalone diver, and now lobster fisherman, commented on the state's current process to develop a lobster fishery management plan. He emphasized how important he felt a trap limit could be, and encouraged those that agreed to consider speaking up on this.

Jenn Feinberg Eckerle, a consultant with the Natural Resources Defense Council, asked if council members had a sense for the estimated cost of a 10-year review/reporting of the Channel Islands MPAs. Dr. Bob Warner was unsure of the costs but pointed out that such a review would need to be based on existing data (not new data collection). For context, John Ugoretz added that the 5-year Channel Islands MPA review/symposium probably cost about \$200,000.

### **Recognizing and Assisting Family of Fallen Coast Guard Officer**

After integrated a few minor editorial suggestions, the council voted 16-0 to approve the sending of a letter drafted by council member Maria Petueli to offer condolences to the surviving family of Coast Guard officer Terrell Horne III, who was killed in December 2012 while working within the sanctuary. The approved letter [available at [http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/report\\_doc.html](http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/report_doc.html)] includes the statements that: "We are grateful for his service. The courage and dedication that he, and the rest of your family, has exhibited allowed him to selflessly serve our community. This is highly commendable and our community is indebted to your family for your sacrifice." Council members also signed a card and generously pooled together donations of money and family-friendly passes to local attractions. Maria Petueli will follow through with deliveries.

### **Ships and Whales**

CINMS Resource Protection Coordinator Sean Hastings reported on collaborative development of a new poster designed for placement on the bridge of ships to help educate mariners on how to identify whales and report sightings. CINMS and NOAA Fisheries staff have been working on the poster with TL Garrett of the Pacific Merchant Shipping Association, who is providing funding and distribution support. Sanctuary staff has also been working with EarthNC to continue with testing of a prototype "Whale Spotter" mobile device app, to be released soon. Sean also mentioned that through an agreement reached with the National Marine Sanctuary Foundation, the Pacific Merchant Shipping Association will be funding some aerial overflights of the shipping lanes beginning on June 1<sup>st</sup> which also marks the day when amendments to the Santa Barbara Channel shipping lanes go into effect.

Mary Byrd with the Santa Barbara Air Pollution Control District provided the council with an update on the Vessel Speed Reduction Incentive Initiative that her office is pursuing, with partnering support from CINMS and EDC. She noted that the SAC provided one of the very first letters of support for the idea of using state cap-and-trade auction funds to help put in place an incentivized program to slow down ships, resulting in reductions of greenhouse gas emissions as well as improved safety for whales. However, she reported, the first-year auction proceeds is going to be loaned back to the State to cover other budget shortfalls. The money is to be paid back to the cap and trade program next year, so hopefully the Vessel Speed Reduction Incentive Initiative will again be considered for funding.

Elizabeth Petras from NOAA Fisheries explained plans for the summer/fall 2013 whale advisory zone in our area. This year a large whale advisory zone will be the subject of advisories to mariners requesting that they watch out for whales, and slow down if they can. However, noting that the approach had not worked in the past, Elizabeth explained that there would not be a specific 10-knot ship speed recommendation for the Santa Barbara Channel. That said, Elizabeth also commented that if timely information is received about, for example, groups of blue whales being right in the shipping lane, then additional specific messaging to the industry could be

considered. In response to a question, Elizabeth commented that revised threshold conditions that could trigger a speed reduction notice had not yet been developed. John Ugoretz cautioned that with any reporting of sighted whale locations, there is always the danger that those receiving the information may think that in areas where no sightings are being reports that whales are not present – which is not true.

Conservation seat member Kristi Birney provided an interim update on the Conservation Working Group's (CWG) review of progress made to implement ship strike recommendations made by the SAC in 2009. She showed the council a portion of the report being developed so that they could appreciate the extent of details being captured and the amount of actions over time that had been taken or attempted. Kristi also mentioned that Andrea Dransfield from CINMS is working on a comparison report between the 2009 CINMS advisory council recommendations and the 2012 Joint Working Group Report from Gulf of the Farallones and Cordell Bank national marine sanctuary advisory councils to determine if there may be aspects of the newer report of interest to the CINMS area.

### **Sanctuary Classic Recreational Fishing and Photography Tournament, 2013**

Tom Raftican with the Sportfishing Conservancy thanked the advisory council for the Sanctuary Classic support letter that was sent last year, and described plans for the return this summer of the tournament from June 8 - Sept. 2. There will be a national press release, press release templates for local use, posters, banners, and a guide to best practices. Tom noted that the council's 2012 letter had suggested a workshop on best fishing practices, and that plans are in the works for that to happen this summer. Shauna Bingham from CINMS followed Tom and described how media kits and Facebook posts will be used to promote the tournament, and how the best practices workshop might be held at the new Channel Islands Boating Center.

### **Presentation by Dr. Todd Braje: Archeology and Historical Ecology on the Northern Channel Islands: Applications for Resource Management**

Dani Lipski introduced Todd Braje, an Assistant Professor with the Department of Anthropology at San Diego State University. Dr. Braje presented on his work at the northern Channel Islands (slides available upon request). In his presentation he explained how there are 13,000 years of records on the islands and that it is known that the Chumash had an extensive community system at the islands. Looking at archeological records, Dr. Braje and others have been able to detect and describe the fishing and harvesting of marine mammals, fish, and invertebrates over long periods of time. This baseline data can be used to inform management decisions, he explained. The council expressed appreciation for the presentation and the innovative research that Dr. Braje is conducting. Questions and discussion from the council focused on some of the differences that the research shows between the community that is found on the islands presently and what might have been there in the past. Dr. Braje also explained the careful and respectful manner that his work is conducted, following proper protocols for obtaining permission and with Chumash observers present.

### **Working Group Reports**

Bill Struble with the NOAA Office of Law Enforcement reported that the Channel Islands Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) on Enforcement met recently and focused discussion time on the panga situation.

Business seat member Michael Cohen reported that the Marketing Subcommittee had not met recently. He encouraged everyone to share the nice Facebook posts that are being put out by CINMS.

Maria Petueli reported that the Sanctuary Education Team (SET) may have lined up another high school group with the ONMS Ocean Guardian's Program, which could result in another youth group working with the SET and attending SAC meetings. Oak Park High School has an ocean acidification project going that could be a good fit. Maria also reported that the SET will be working on next steps to refine MPA education messaging now that they have worked through communications about this with the RAP.

Capt. David Bacon did not have a Recreational Fishing Working Group meeting to report on, but informed the council that the recreational fishing industry is now even more behind artificial reefs. He noted that the local Fish Reef Project is moving forward into permitting processes.

Bruce Steele did not have a Commercial Fishing Working Group meeting to report on, but he let the council know about problems with water management on the Santa Ynez River that will negatively affect steelhead.

Kristi Birney reported on issues discussed at the recent Conservation Working Group meeting [notes available at <http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/pdf/cwg05-15-13.pdf>], noting that UCSB Bren Group socioeconomic project on sanctuary use is now online, and mentioning that a new group has formed in our area called the Channel Islands Seabird Protection Network.

### **Meeting Close-out**

Chair Dianne Black closed out the meeting, noting the upcoming 2013 SAC meeting dates: July 18, September 20, and November 15. Staff explained that the changing of the July 19<sup>th</sup> date to July 18<sup>th</sup> was necessary due to a NOAA workforce furlough planned for July 19<sup>th</sup>. [Note: subsequent to this change, the furlough was cancelled and the July SAC meeting was rescheduled again for the originally planned date of July 19<sup>th</sup>].

**Meeting Attendance Roster (5/17/2013):**

Andrea Mills	Tourism	Present
Capt. Mat Curto	Tourism - Alternate	Absent
Debra Herring	Non-Consumptive Recreation	Present
Stuart Wilson	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	Present
Michael Cohen	Business	Present
Capt. Kip Louttit	Business - Alternate	Present
Kristi Birney	Conservation	Present
Greg Helms	Conservation - Alternate	Present
Bruce Steele	Commercial Fishing	Present
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	Present
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	Present
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	Present
Maria Petueli [Council Secretary]	Education	Present
Amanda Allen	Education - Alternate	Present
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	Present
Dr. Mark Steele	Research - Alternate	Absent
Phyllis Grifman [Council Vice Chair]	Public At Large #1	Present
Victor Cox	Public At Large #1 - Alternate	Present
Eric Kett	Public At Large #2	Present
Richard Block	Public At Large #2 - Alternate	Present
Luhui Isha Ward	Chumash Community	Absent
Mati Waiya	Chumash Community - Alternate	Absent
Elizabeth Petras	NOAA Fisheries	Present
Shelby Mendez	NOAA Fisheries - Alternate	Present
Russell Galipeau	National Park Service	Absent
David Ashe	National Park Service - Alternate	Present
CDR Christina Davidson	US Coast Guard	Absent
LT Cody Dunagan	US Coast Guard – Alternate	Present
Donna Schroeder	Bureau of Ocean Energy Mgmt (BOEM)	Absent
Dr. Ann Bull	BOEM - Alternate	Absent
John Ugoretz	Dept. of Defense	Present
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense - Alternate	Present
Paul Hamdorf	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife	Absent
Kristine Barsky	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife - Alternate	Absent
Rich Rozzelle	CA Natural Resources Agency	Present
Amy Vierra	CA Natural Resources Agency - Alternate	Absent
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	Absent
Steve Hudson	CA Coastal Commission - Alternate	Absent
Dianne Black [Council Chair]	Santa Barbara County	Present
Susan Curtis	Santa Barbara County - Alternate	Present
Gary Hirtensteiner	Ventura County	Absent
<vacant>	Ventura County - Alternate	---
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	Present
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	Absent
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Absent
Maria Brown	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	Absent